

IMPLEMENTATION OF ENVIRONMENTALLY SUSTAINABLE PROCUREMENT OF GOODS AND SERVICES IN THE WEST KALIMANTAN PROVINCIAL GOVERNMENT

Nur Aliuddin^{1*}, Petrus², Nafsiatun³

^{1,2,3}Regional Autonomy Law, Master of Law, Tanjung Pura University, Pontianak, Indonesia
aliabunabasa@gmail.com^{1*}, petrusptk04@gmail.com², nafsiatun2017@gmail.com³

Abstract

This study examines the implementation of the Green Public Procurement (GPP) policy in West Kalimantan using the perspective of Meter and Horn's (1975) theory. This theory posits that policy implementation will be successful if small changes and goal consensus are achieved. However, the implementation of GPP in West Kalimantan is not yet optimal due to generic policy standards, lack of inter-organizational collaboration, weak coordination, and lack of commitment from implementers. The author developed a Sustainable GPP Policy Implementation Model that includes the dimensions of normative instruments, policy resources, implementation activities, and actor compliance. This model adds crucial components of leadership and collaboration to policy implementation. The author offers several recommendations to improve GPP implementation, including strengthening the legal framework, providing incentives for policy implementers, developing comprehensive operational procedures, and establishing partnerships with academics for further research.

Keywords: Implementation, Procurement of Goods and Services, Environmentally Sustainable, West Kalimantan Provincial Government

INTRODUCTION

Sustainable development has become an international agenda formulated by the UN with the term Sustainable Development Goals (SDG's), which is a continuation of the Millennium Development Goals (MDG's), where the agenda objective of this activity is the real action of countries. who are members of the United Nations to overcome poverty, inequality and other environmental problems in the form of real action. The European Commission (2016:4) states that government spending in the field of public works, procurement of goods and services represents around 14% of the GDP of European countries, and by using this purchasing power to select goods, services and areas of public works (such as; construction, health services and transportation) that can reduce impacts on the environment, they can make important contributions at the local, regional, national and international levels of the sustainable development goals.

Often we do not realize the influence of the importance of consumption and production patterns on the impact on the environment, every human being who lives and has activities will of course consume goods, both basic needs and secondary needs, etc., where to fulfill these needs will often encourage exploitation of natural resources which of course will ultimately affect the environment. Humans need food, while producing the food itself requires land and other supporting needs (irrigation, fertilizer, factory-produced packaging, etc.). Likewise for other needs, such as housing, etc., which of course will require land and building materials extracted from natural resources. According to Brears (2018: 5), between 2010 and 2015 alone there was a growth of 37% in 53 developing countries with incomes of around 10,000 USD, so it is estimated that in the next two decades 3 million people will reach the middle class level, which will have the consequence of growing demand for goods. , where to fulfill these needs of course natural resources include; water, energy, metals and various other natural resources.

In carrying out development, each government budgets development financing to achieve the goal of improving the welfare of its people, both physical and non-physical development. Physical development including facilities and infrastructure; such as roads, bridges, buildings, and various other physical facilities. Meanwhile, for non-physical activities, these include; community training, community empowerment, increasing the capacity of government officials, social assistance, etc., all of which are intended for the people's economic growth. Development activities carried out by the government, which issues a budget and spends it on development financing, including the procurement of goods/services, will have an impact on the community's economy. Azwar (2016:15) concluded by presenting the research results as follows,

The results of the findings and statistical analysis show that changes in the realization value of government procurement of goods/services have an impact on the Indonesian economy as measured by growth indicators. This analysis shows that changes in Indonesian economic conditions, which are marked by changes in growth indicators, will also have an impact on the level of expenditure realization or government spending through the procurement of goods/services, which means that the level of realization and economic conditions have a reciprocal relationship that influences each other.

The development of an Environmentally Friendly Procurement of Goods and Services (GPP) policy in Indonesia has strategic value in encouraging the implementation of the agenda for sustainable consumption and production patterns by promoting environmentally friendly procurement practices for goods/services (target 12.7) within the government. The aim of the GPP Policy is to provide a list of environmentally friendly goods/services products that can be used to realize the procurement of environmentally friendly goods/services with efficient use of human resources and preservation of environmental functions to ensure the implementation of sustainable development. The GPP policy is strategic, cross-sectoral and involves parties,

including the Government Goods/Services Procurement Agency/LKPP, Ministries/Agencies, Provincial Governments and City/Regency Governments in Indonesia.

The amount of budget spent annually by the government is not small, where the West Kalimantan government itself in 2023 will spend a budget of more than 2.4 trillion (General Procurement Plan Information System, LKPP 2023), and this budget is planned to be realized, both physically and non-physically, in 2023 budget year, while the 2024 budget is planned at 2.5 trillion. In its implementation, this budgeting is divided into 87 (eighty seven) agencies within the West Kalimantan Provincial Government to finance their respective programs and activities. By each agency, which has different main tasks and functions, the budgeting is aimed at achieving the goals of each agency in accordance with its main tasks, in achieving increased welfare of the people in West Kalimantan according to the objectives in the strategic plan of the West Kalimantan provincial government.

In implementing the development of facilities and infrastructure as well as non-physical ones in the form of various kinds of training, community empowerment, etc. of course it is needed in the form of goods and/or services, whether provided directly or through providers or usually called partners. Where often, the procurement of goods or services only considers functional aspects from the economic and technological side, and does not yet consider other value aspects such as sustainability value, and/or other external values such as the value of origin or source of raw materials. So often agencies that provide goods/services only consider their implementation in the current budget year, without taking too much into account other aspects such as service life, the amount of resources needed for the operation/use of the goods/services (for example, how much electricity is used, materials exhausted fuel oil, etc.), and/or the source of the raw materials, for example, the legality of wood materials, other mining materials, and so on. Faiza (2012:123) concluded that "Concern for the environment is proven not to have a significant influence in explaining purchasing behavior for environmentally friendly products", especially in Jakarta and surrounding cities.

In the implementation of government procurement of goods and services, it not only has an impact on the economy, which is intended to improve people's welfare, but also of course has an impact on the environment, especially on aspects of the sustainability of environmental functions. Therefore, when procuring goods and services, you should consider other things besides the functional and economic aspects, because often these goods/services have an impact on the environment that is not taken into account. This is quite logical considering that in general, the agency proposing the procurement of goods/services does not have sufficient knowledge regarding the origin of the materials to be used and/or what impacts they can have, especially on the environment, if the use of the goods and services has expired (unused). Again).

The procurement of goods and services carried out by the government every year has quite an impact considering that the amount can be said to be quite large. So both the use of raw materials and the impact of waste and/or energy use in operations will also be quite large. Kurzweil (2005) in Shmelev (2017:3) said that the production of food, clothing, housing, entertainment, transportation and various other things, apart from improving the economy, will also produce pollution and waste. Apart from that, the procurement of goods and services carried out by the government can be a driving force for changes in production and consumption patterns because of the large budget spent by the government each year, so that the market opportunities created by the procurement of goods and services will certainly be utilized by producers, and often producers will follow the wishes/parameters of the users of their products/services. Therefore, it is very important to be able to take into account the environmental aspects involved in the process of implementing goods and services carried out by the government, in this case the West Kalimantan provincial government.

So the influence of procuring environmentally friendly/sustainable goods/services is very large where the government's purchasing power will cause producers, let alone consumers

who are government agencies themselves, to become parties who care about the environmental aspects of their economic activities, and in the end it is hoped that this can change Current consumption and production patterns do not care about environmental aspects, so that the concept of a "green economy" can truly be applied.

With the various things stated above, it becomes interesting study material, and considering the potential for implementing environmentally friendly/sustainable procurement of goods/services, especially in West Kalimantan Province, which can help preserve environmental functions while still paying attention to the fulfillment of the functions of procurement of these goods/services. itself, especially to continue to function as a government tool in improving the welfare of the people in West Kalimantan.

RESEARCH METHODS

This chapter explains research methods which include research concepts and models, research processes, identification of research variables, population, samples and research respondents, data collection methods, data analysis methods and planned research schedules.

Based on the background, problem formulation and objectives, this research is exploratory research using a survey method using a questionnaire as a data collection tool. The purpose of data collection is to collect information regarding the Implementation of Environmentally Friendly/Sustainable Procurement of Goods and Services in the West Kalimantan Provincial Government.

The research location is where the data source is located. The data source or data research location is considered as a population so that samples can be taken as the object under study. The location chosen by the researchers was the West Kalimantan Provincial Government Goods and Services Procurement Bureau.

To obtain valid data, it is necessary to have a technique that can be used appropriately according to the problem being studied, meaning that with this method it is hoped that the required data can be searched and obtained in accordance with the research objectives. In this research, several data collection methods were used, namely:

1. Observation Method

According to Marzuki, the observation method can be interpreted as systematically observing and recording the symptoms or phenomena being investigated (M. Iqbal Hasan, 2002)

According to Muhammad Ali, observation is research carried out by observing objects, either directly or indirectly.

Observation is a systematic observation and recording technique of the phenomena being investigated. Observations are carried out to find data and information from symptoms or phenomena (events or occurrences) systematically and based on the research objectives that have been formulated.

The observations carried out by the researcher were direct observations at the research site and made several observations regarding phenomena in the West Kalimantan Provincial Government, and made observation data for research. The observations that researchers have made are observing phenomena that occur in the West Kalimantan Provincial Government related to research.

2. Interview/ Interview

Interview is a data collection technique by asking questions directly by the interviewer to be interviewed, and the answers are recorded or recorded. Broadly speaking, there are three kinds of guidelines for conducting research using the interview method.

3. Documentation

Documentation is a record of past events, documents can be in the form of writing, images

or monumental works from other people, such as biographies, regulations, policies, photos, films, etc. This documentation method is no less important than the observation and interview method. Data obtained from documentation results can be used to test, interpret and even predict. In collecting data, researchers collect the necessary data related to problems. Apart from observations and interviews with data sources, researchers use documentation.

The stage after data collection is data analysis. The objectives of this data analysis are:

1. Data can be given meaning that is useful in solving research problems.
2. Shows the relationships between the phenomena contained in the research.
3. To provide answers to the hypotheses proposed in the research.
4. Material for making conclusions as well as useful implications and suggestions for further research policy.

The data analysis technique that the researcher used was a descriptive analysis technique, namely collecting data in the form of words and images originating from interview scripts, field notes, photos and quantitative analysis techniques in the form of analysis of the Implementation of Environmentally Friendly/Sustainable Procurement of Goods and Services in the West Kalimantan Provincial Government. After all the data required for this research has been collected, the data is then processed and presented using descriptive analysis techniques through stages.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Analyze the components that influence the implementation of the procurement of environmentally friendly/sustainable goods and services within the West Kalimantan Provincial Government.

1. What is the aim of sustainable procurement of goods/services (Sustainable Public Procurement) or Green Public Procurement

The main reason for using sustainable procurement as an environmental policy instrument is because of the large government spending on goods/services. Procurement of goods and services of great value will also require large natural resources, which can have a direct or indirect effect on natural sustainability, environmental pollution, biodiversity and climate change. This effect on nature is not only seen from the use of raw materials/materials in significant quantities, but also emissions resulting from the process of procuring goods/services from the production process, transportation, up to the use stage. The aim of sustainable procurement of goods/services or GPP in EU GPP is to control and protect natural resources and the environment by implementing regulations related to the environment that focus on climate change, resource use and sustainable consumption and production, especially in the procurement of goods/ public services. The objectives of sustainable procurement of goods/services can generally be summarized as follows:

- a. produce the right goods/services for every money spent, measured in terms of quality, quantity, time, cost, location and provider
- b. increase the use of environmentally friendly local and domestic products
- c. increasing the participation of micro, small and medium businesses
- d. increasing the role of local and national business actors in the production of environmentally friendly goods/services
- e. support the implementation of research and utilization of goods/services resulting from research
- f. increase the participation of creative industries in the production of environmentally friendly goods/services

- g. encouraging economic equality, improving the quality of health and welfare of the community and
- h. encourage sustainable procurement.

2. Benefits and Constraints of Sustainable Procurement of Goods/Services

The benefits of sustainable procurement of goods/services are not only limited to reducing impacts on the environment but are related to social, health, economic and political issues. In the city of Vienna, implementing sustainable procurement through the "Eco Buy" program can reduce 100,00 tons of CO₂ from 2001 to 2001 and save 44.4 thousand Euros. In the Netherlands, implementing sustainable procurement can reduce 3,000 tons of CO₂ and reduce public sector energy consumption by 10%. If all of Europe implemented a purchasing policy for all IT products such as the Copenhagen City Council and the Swedish Administrative Development Agency, energy consumption in Europe could be cut by 30 terrawatt-hours or the equivalent of 4 nuclear power plants. Sustainable procurement can be used by public authorities to address environmental issues such as deforestation, through the purchase of wood products that are legally logged and managed with sustainable development principles reducing CO₂ emissions, through the purchase of products with low CO₂ emissions throughout their economic life. Sustainable procurement can also be used as a means of controlling the use of natural resources, reducing pollution, supporting sustainable development, improving the quality of life, and caring for the quality of the environment. From an economic perspective, sustainable procurement can save costs and natural resources when considering LCC. Politically, implementing sustainable procurement shows the public sector's commitment to improving the environment and sustainability of production and consumption. Barriers to implementing sustainable procurement of goods/services in various countries, based on study results, implementing sustainable procurement encounters various obstacles from the government, provider and community. These obstacles can include political obstacles, misperceptions regarding sustainable procurement, lack of environmentally friendly products and low commitment to implementing sustainable procurement.

Below are some of the obstacles reported from various countries.

- a. Lack of political support from stakeholders.
- b. This is shown by the results of a study in Europe (Butter, 2013), that most public authorities do not provide political support for sustainable procurement.
- c. Environmentally friendly products are considered more expensive (Bulrer, 2013).
- d. Stakeholders do not understand that environmentally friendly products are more expensive, so they choose goods/services with a lower initial investment. Most evaluations of winners for procurement of goods/services are carried out based on the lowest price and a few use price evaluation throughout the economic life.
- e. Lack of information and practical tools.
- f. Lack of training for stakeholders.
- g. Lack of cooperation between stakeholders
- h. Limited criteria for goods/services that meet environmentally friendly criteria.

3. What are the Criteria for Sustainable Procurement of Goods/Services or Green Public Procurement (GPP)

The Sustainable Procurement of Goods/Services or Green Public Procurement (GPP) criteria aims to provide a reference for the procurement of goods/services for public authorities to reduce environmental impacts. Use of these criteria is voluntary. The EU has developed criteria divided into several groups which are regularly updated. The criteria related to the procurement of goods/services for new building construction that

are used as a reference are the criteria for office buildings, indoor lighting, sanitary tapware and toilets and urinals. The criteria for sustainable procurement in Indonesia adopt the criteria used in the EU GPP, in accordance with the results of agreements between world countries. In EU GPP, there are two levels in each EU GPP criteria with the following details:

- a. Core criteria, is the application of low-level GPP which focuses on the environmental performance of goods/services but still tries to minimize costs.
- b. Comprehensive criteria or complete criteria are a higher-level application of GPP and are used by authorities that really support successful environmental performance and innovation.

This level is assessed from the process stages in procuring goods/services as described in the Buying Green Handbook by the European Commission (2016), namely subject matter, selection criteria, technical specifications, award criteria and contract performance clause. The explanation of these things is as follows:

- a. The subject matter in a contract is determining what goods/services are to be provided. In GPP, the choice of subject matter is important because it explains the permitted specifications and other criteria to be applied.
- b. Selection criteria is an evaluation of the ability of the provider of goods/services to carry out the contract to be followed based on specific abilities and competencies related to environmental aspects related to the subject matter of the contract.
- c. Technical specifications are the characteristics required for goods/services. Technical specifications include energy, materials, water and noise according to Testa et al (2016).
- d. Award criteria is an evaluation in selecting service providers with the best environmental performance. Award criteria can stimulate additional environmental performance according to Dodd et al (2016).
- e. The contract performance clause is how the work contract will be implemented and monitors the work process to see whether it meets technical specifications.

In this research, there are two levels of criteria for GPP implementation efforts in the questionnaire in each of the EU GPP criteria as already mentioned, namely core and comprehensive criteria, however 32 Current Procurement, Environmentally Based Procurement these levels are not differentiated in detail because they are considered to both fulfill GPP principles.

Goods/Services Procurement Process within the West Kalimantan Provincial Government

1. Definition and scope of Government Procurement of Goods/Services

According to Article 1 of Presidential Regulation Number 16 of 2018 as amended by Presidential Regulation Number 12 of 2021, Government Procurement of Goods/Services is the activity of Procurement of Goods/Services by Ministries/Institutions/Regional Apparatus financed by the APBN/APBD whose process starts from identification of needs, until the handover of the work results. According to Siahaya, Procurement is an effort to obtain goods and services that are needed and is carried out based on logical and systematic thinking, following norms and ethics and in accordance with standard procurement methods which are carried out as procurement guidelines. Meanwhile, according to Christopher & Schooner (2007) Procurement is an activity to obtain goods or services in a transparent, effective and efficient manner according to the needs and desires of users. The scope of Government Procurement of Goods/Services includes:

- a. Goods;
- b. Construction Work;

- c. Consultancy Services; And
- d. Other Services.

2. Legal Basis for Procurement of Government Goods/Services

In the Government Procurement of Goods/Services there is an agreement between the parties so of course there is a legal basis that regulates the Procurement. Procurement of Government Goods/Services is regulated in Presidential Regulation Number 16 of 2018 concerning Procurement of Government Goods/Services as amended by Presidential Regulation Number 12 of 2021 concerning Amendments to Presidential Regulation Number 16 of 2018 concerning Procurement of Government Goods/Services.

3. Objectives of Procurement of Government Goods and Services

Objectives of Government Procurement of Goods/Services:

- a. produce the right goods/services for every money spent, measured from the aspects of quality, quantity, time, cost, location and provider;
- b. increase the use of domestic products;
- c. increasing the participation of Micro Enterprises, Small Enterprises and Cooperatives;
- d. increasing the role of National Business Actors;
- e. support the implementation of research and utilization of goods/services resulting from research;
- f. increasing creative industry participation;
- g. realizing economic equality and providing expanded business opportunities;
- h. improve sustainable procurement.

4. Principles and Methods of Procurement of Government Goods/Services

The principles of Government Procurement of Goods and Services are:

- a. efficient;
- b. effective;
- c. transparent;
- d. open;
- e. compete;
- f. fair; And
- g. accountable.

The method for Procurement of Government Goods/Services is carried out by:

a. Self-Management;

Self-management activities are a way of obtaining goods/services that are carried out independently by Ministries/Institutions/Regional Apparatus, other Ministries/Institutions/Regional Apparatus, community organizations, or community groups.

b. Provider.

Procurement activities through Providers are by obtaining goods/services provided by Business Actors.

5. Government Goods/Services Procurement Actors

a. Budget or PA Users

Namely, the official who holds the authority to use the budget of a State Ministry/Institution/Regional Apparatus who is responsible for Procurement of Government Goods and Services activities, PA can delegate his authority to the KPA or Budget User Authority.

b. Budget User Power or KPA

KPA is an official who obtains power from the PA to carry out some of the authority

and responsibility for budget use at the State Ministry/Institution concerned. KPA also has the authority to respond to appeal objections from participants in construction work tenders.

c. Commitment Making Official or PPK

PPK is an official who is given the authority by the PA/KPA to make decisions and take actions that can result in the expenditure of the state budget/regional budget.

d. Procurement Officer

Procurement Officer is an administrative official/functional official/personnel who is tasked with carrying out Direct Procurement, Direct Appointment, and/or E-purchasing or purchasing goods/services through an electronic catalog system.

e. Election Working Group

The Selection Working Group is a human resource appointed by the head of the Goods/Services Procurement Work Unit (UKPBJ) to manage the selection of Providers.

f. Procurement Agent

Procurement Agent is a UKPBJ or Business Actor who carries out part or all of the work of Procurement of Goods/Services who is entrusted by the Ministry/Institution/Regional Apparatus as the work provider.

g. Self-Management Organizer

Self-Managed Organizer is a Team that organizes activities in a Self-Managed manner.

h. Provider

Provider is a business actor who provides goods/services based on a contract.

6. Electronic Procurement of Goods/Services

In line with current technological developments, Government Procurement of Goods/Services can also be carried out online or electronically. Electronic Procurement Services are information technology management services to facilitate the implementation of electronic procurement of goods/services. Procurement of goods/services is carried out electronically using an information system consisting of the Electronic Procurement System (SPSE) and supporting systems developed by LKPP or the Government Goods/Services Procurement Policy Institute. Procurement of goods/services electronically by utilizing e-marketplace. E-marketplace is an electronic market provided to meet the government's need for goods/services. The Goods/Services Procurement e-marketplace provides technical infrastructure and transaction support services for Ministries/Institutions/Regional Governments and Providers in the form of:

- a. Electronic Catalog;
- b. Online Store; And
- c. Provider Selection.

West Kalimantan Provincial Government's Readiness in Implementing Environmentally Friendly and/or Sustainable Procurement of Goods/Services within the West Kalimantan Provincial Government

1. Policy support and incentives

Green Infrastructure/Green Labeled Products generally require special materials and technology. Often, these two factors of production require high costs so they need policy support and incentives for their implementation. Currently, there are many countries, including neighboring countries, that have implemented green infrastructure principles. Therefore, internalizing the green concept in infrastructure development in Indonesia is mandatory. As stated previously, PPB in Indonesia is regulated in Presidential Regulation

no. 16 of 2018 (Presidential Decree 16/2018) concerning Government Procurement of Goods/Services Article 97 Contemporary Procurement, Environmentally Based Procurement 68. Article 68 Paragraphs 1 and 2 state that the Procurement of Goods/Services pays attention to sustainability aspects, namely economic, social and environmental aspects. The rules for implementing sustainable procurement use the phrase "pay attention", it is not mandatory. This will increase the possibility that the implementation of sustainable procurement will still be incidental and not yet a structured, massive movement. The absence of standards, criteria and indicators in implementing sustainable procurement can also result in the implementation of sustainable procurement not being optimal. To ensure its implementation, the Government needs to issue derivative regulations containing implementation standards, criteria and indicators for implementing sustainable procurement.

Apart from policy support for goods users (government) in implementing sustainable procurement, support is also needed for service providers (private sector) so that they are interested in investing in green technology. Support can be in the form of easy investment policies and also incentives, for example in the form of tax reductions and so on. This needs to be done so that there is sufficient supply and demand in implementing Green Public Procurement in Indonesia.

Every activity in the government environment requires the existence of goods and services. Almost all goods and services are produced by utilizing natural resources which will have an impact on the environment. Awareness in purchasing goods and services that consider environmental aspects, especially in government agencies, is demonstrated by including environmental aspects as a consideration in determining the type of goods or equipment and services for procuring government goods and services.

Therefore, every process of procuring goods and services within the government is encouraged to pay attention to sustainability and environmental sustainability through an environmentally friendly goods and services procurement system or sustainable procurement (Green Public Procurement, GPP). The concept of procuring environmentally friendly goods and services has been mandated in:

- a. Law Number 32 of 2000
- b. Government Regulation Number 46 of 2017 98 Current Procurement, Environmentally Based Procurement
- c. Presidential Regulation Number 59 of 2017 concerning the implementation of achieving sustainable development goals
- d. Presidential Regulation Number 16 of 2018 and LKPP Regulation Number. 2018
- e. as well as Minister of Environment and Forestry Regulation Number 5 of 2019

The scheme used as a criterion in the Sustainable Procurement of Goods and Services is a collaborative agreement between the ministries/institutions that own the scheme to move forward together to safeguard environmental and sustainability aspects across sectors.

Utilization of environmentally friendly goods and services is related to savings in government operational costs from an economic perspective, legality and sustainability of raw materials, efficiency of energy and water resources, product life cycle considerations, use of materials suitable for recycling, reduction of air emissions, hazardous and toxic materials, waste produced, as well as Green House Gas emissions from an environmental and sustainability perspective.

Other policies created to move towards the goals of sustainable development and sustainable procurement include:

- a. Implementation of energy conservation by applying energy saving level labels to household electrical equipment including air conditioners, refrigerators, washing

machines, etc. in accordance with the mandate of Law no. 30 of 2007 concerning Energy and PP no. 70 of 2009 which came into effect in 2018.

- b. Issued Presidential Decree 59 of 2017 concerning Implementation of the Achievement of Sustainable Development Goals.
- c. The Ministry of Forestry and Environment and the National Standardization Agency have issued 13 types of SNI ecolabels for environmentally friendly products. Environmental Friendly Label Criteria or eco labels are applied to goods and services:
 - 1) based on energy use;
 - 2) made from raw materials or based on natural resources; And
 - 3) made from recycled materials.

In general, the implementation of Sustainable Procurement of Goods and Services includes:

- a. goods;
- b. technology;
- c. consulting services; and
- d. other services, taking into account the availability of sustainable (environmentally friendly) goods and services on local markets and local suppliers.

The list of Environmentally Friendly Goods and Services established by the Minister of Environment and Forestry is used as a basis for Sustainable Procurement of Goods and Services by Ministries/Institutions/Regional Apparatus and can be carried out:

- a. addition to the list of Environmentally Friendly Goods and Services 1 (one) time in 1 (one) year; and/or
- b. evaluation of Environmentally Friendly Goods and Services at least 1 (one) time in 5 (five) years.

Additions to the list and evaluation of Environmentally Friendly Goods and Services are determined after coordinating with the minister/head of institution in charge of business and/or activities and determined by Ministerial Decree. In carrying out coordination, the Minister formed a technical team for Environmentally Friendly Goods and Services. The technical team for Environmentally Friendly Goods and Services consists of:

- a. representatives of ministries/institutions/regional/institutional work units in charge of business and/or activities;
- b. representatives of institutions responsible for procurement of government goods/services;
- c. representatives of institutions responsible for the field of technology assessment and application; And
- d. representatives of institutions responsible for supervising business competition.

2. Obstacles in Implementing Sustainable Procurement

The implementation of sustainable procurement in Indonesia has begun, but not all Ministries/Institutions/Regional Apparatus have implemented sustainable procurement. There are several reasons why sustainable procurement has not been implemented, in accordance with Presidential Decree 16/2018, sustainable procurement is not yet an obligation that must be implemented in each government organization. The parties involved in improving environmental quality are still developing regulations that can be used and applied in various sectors. There are still many obstacles that hinder the implementation of sustainable procurement apart from regulations, political commitment, resources (vendors/providers, producers, procurement actors, etc.), national goals to improve environmental quality and so on.

With the issuance of the Minister of Environment and Forestry's Regulation and the declaration of sustainable procurement, Ministries/Institutions/Regional Apparatus are

encouraged to immediately implement the use of environmentally friendly goods and implement sustainable procurement.

Even though there is no national obligation to implement sustainable procurement, several ministries and regional governments have started implementing sustainable procurement, although it is still at a trial level. At least there is a good intention to start improving environmental quality.

There are several obstacles in implementing GPP, quoted from Testa et al (2015), including:

- a. Finance is the main obstacle according to Bouwer et al, Walker et al and Brammer and Walker. There is a tendency to use cheaper products compared to sustainable and more expensive products according to Willis.
- b. Lack of awareness of GPP in the work environment according to Swanson et al, Bjorklund et al and Bratt et al, such as the importance of implementing the GPP agenda by managers or awareness among employees of GPP.
- c. Lack of knowledge, information and competence among the parties involved in the goods/services procurement process and how to formulate existing references according to Varnas.

3. Changes in Goods/Services Procurement Paradigm

Changes in ways of thinking, ways of living and a better understanding of improving environmental quality can change the way Contemporary Procurement, Environmentally Based Procurement of goods/services is made in the government environment, both in Ministries/Institutions/Regional Apparatus. Changes continue to be made through innovations carried out by policy makers and policy implementers. Through e-procurement which has been previously implemented by the Indonesian government, the Indonesian government has initiated a paperless movement in the process of procuring goods/services. However, this paperless movement has not yet been implemented 100% because there are still many procurement actors who request or print election documents or procurement documents which were previously distributed via soft files.

Every paper production process requires large amounts of chemicals, water and energy and of course raw materials, which generally come from wood. It takes 15 year old tree to produce 1 ream of paper. The waste generated from the paper production process is also very large, both quantitatively in liquid, gas and solid form, as well as qualitatively. So that this waste does not pollute the environment, high technology and energy are needed to process it.

To meet the national paper demand of around 5.6 million tonnes/year, large quantities of wood are needed which are expensive and cannot be met from Indonesian Industrial Plantation Forests (HTI). Ironically, we see how much paper is around us. such as documents, excessive product packaging, newspapers, magazines, brochures/leaflets/product catalogues, letters, disposable products, etc. In fact, by using used paper as raw material for new paper, the use of trees, chemicals, water and energy can be reduced.

For Pine trees it may be very difficult to ascertain the exact number, but with simple calculations we can estimate it. First, we have to know what tree is meant? A giant tree trunk or just a small tree trunk. Paper is made from Pine tree trunks, so we have to survey them to find out the average diameter of the tree.

Most of the trees are 1 foot (30.5 cm) in diameter and 60 feet (18 meters) high, this produces a volume of 81,430 Cubic inches of wood: $\pi \times \text{radius}^2 \times \text{length} = \text{volume} = 3.14 \times 62 \times (60 \times 12) = 81,430.104$ Procurement Contemporary, Environmentally Based Procurement.

In the field, a 2 x 4 foot sheet of lumber weighs 10 pounds and consists of 504 cubic feet of lumber. This shows that a pine tree weighs about 1,610 pounds ($81,430/504 \times 10$). We know that in making paper, wood is processed into pulp, the yield obtained is only around 50%. Because about half of the trees processed are in the form of knots, lignin or other materials that are not good for making paper. So a pine tree produces about 805 pounds of paper.

If we compare it with the weight of photocopy paper, 1 ream of photocopy paper weighs 5 pounds with 500 sheets of paper. So based on this calculation we get $(805/5 \times 500) = 80,500$ sheets of paper.

If we do not start improving paper consumption patterns from now on, there will be a habit and dependency on always using large amounts of paper. This will of course put continuous pressure on our earth and have an unfavorable impact on the environment.

If an organization consisting of 100 people can save 3 pieces of paper every day, then in a year 156 trees can be saved.

That's why there needs to be a change in the paradigm of procurement of goods/services so that environmental quality is maintained. Even though it is being implemented in stages, there is a clear Road Map to achieve sustainable development goals by 2030.

As a policy maker in the procurement of goods/services, LKPP must complete policies related to sustainable development in the form of technical instructions and implementation instructions in the field of goods/services procurement in the form of LKPP regulations.

Also the auditing parties (BPK, BPKP, Prosecutor's Office, Police and others) must change the paradigm in examining the procurement process no longer with "lowest price" but with "value for money". And procurement actors must truly understand the meaning of "value for money" both administratively, financially and technically so that when determining the winner they no longer look for reasons to win the provider with the lowest bid.

This paradigm must be socialized intently by LKPP so that the understanding of procurement actors is the same in all Ministries/Institutions/Regional Apparatus throughout Indonesia.

CONCLUSION

Based on the theoretical perspective of Meter and Horn (1975) which states that implementation will be most successful, namely only small changes are needed and consensus on high goals, in general the implementation of the GPP policy in West Kalimantan has not been optimal because the small changes required have not been achieved, whereas Consensus goals have not yet been achieved properly. The conditions and situations in policy implementation turned out to be the opposite of the Meter and Horn theory.

In this case, the successful implementation of the GPP policy in West Kalimantan requires major changes from upstream to downstream. Then, the author can specifically state the most dominant cause of the GPP policy not being implemented optimally in West Kalimantan, based on the perspective of the dimensions of the Meter and Horn implementation model, including the following.

1. In the dimensions of policy standards and objectives, implementation is not optimal because policy standards related to action plans and legal frameworks are not yet strong. Policies are still generic. In this case, the Governor's Regulation only states that it is a guideline, the legal framework in both the Presidential Decree and Gubernatorial Regulation does not clearly emphasize the mandatory use of GPP.
2. In the characteristic dimension of the implementing agency, policy implementation is not optimal because the organization and implementation activities related to the action plan and

regulatory and implementing authorities are not yet supported by collaboration. There is no such forum between the center and regions, as well as between regional organizations, such as LKPP and Regional Government, LPSE, UPBJ, and PBJ providers, as well as monitoring units to collaborate in the success of GPP implementation.

3. In the dimensions of inter-organizational communication and implementation activities, policy implementation is not optimal due to coordination related to the ecolabeling scheme not being supported by good leadership. The will of both central and regional leadership does not require the use of GPP. This also means that in general leaders have not provided examples or examples that are able to encourage all parties to use GPP.
4. In the dimensions of the policy environment and implementing attitudes, policy implementation is not optimal due to the policy environment and implementing attitudes not being supported by commitment and compliance to implement the GPP. The attitudes and behavior of implementers and the environmentally friendly product ecosystem from upstream to downstream have not been created properly to support the implementation of GPP.

The Meter and Horn policy implementation model is considered a model that can be used as an analysis parameter. However, in reality there are several dimensions that have not been optimally implemented in West Kalimantan, especially in relation to sustainable development goals. For this reason, in order to provide an ideal and suitable model to be implemented in West Kalimantan, which seeks to complete the gaps in existing models, the author created a Sustainable Green Public Procurement Policy Implementation Model, consisting of the dimensions of normative instruments, policy resources, implementation activities and compliance of policy actors. The novelty of the results of the analysis and model created is the discovery of very important components, namely leadership and collaboration which have not been dominantly discussed in the Horn and Meter models.

These components were considered by the author to be included in the new dimensions section of the Sustainable GPP Policy Implementation Model. Based on the conclusions outlined above, the author makes several suggestions as follows:

1. To the Central Government, in the proposed Draft Law on Government Procurement of Goods and Services, it is mandatory to implement Green Public Procurement in all Central and Regional government environments. To the Central Government, so that all environmentally friendly products in the Simbarjasramling catalog at the Ministry of Environment and Forestry can be connected to e- catalog in LKPP making it easier for Ministries/Agencies/Regions/Institutions to purchase environmentally friendly goods and services electronically.
2. The West Kalimantan Provincial Government needs to provide rewards in the form of awards, additional credit figures or performance allowances for implementing officials, or additional budget allocations for SKPDs that implement GPP in the procurement of goods/services and programs that lead to GPP, as well as providing punishment in the form of reduced allocations. budget. Meanwhile, rewards also apply to other agencies that help expedite the GPP process in procuring government goods/services. Likewise, punishment applies to other agencies, for example agencies that are indicated to complicate the GPP process in procuring goods/services. In this case, the provincial government needs to identify OPD programs that lead to GPP.
3. The West Kalimantan Provincial Government needs to prepare comprehensive Standard Operational Procedures as technical guidance for implementers of GPP policies. In this case, for PBJ actors and providers, sustainable environmentally friendly government procurement practices for goods and services are achieved. Apart from that, it is necessary to improve the implementation of internal and external supervision in the implementation of procurement of goods and services so that it is carried out within the GPP corridor optimally.

4. As a form of commitment to implementing the Green Public Procurement Policy in Sustainable Development, the West Kalimantan Provincial Government in preparing the APBD has made an official policy that the proportion of regional spending on household office equipment between 30-40% will be directed towards environmentally friendly products, as well as involving UKPBJ elements in implementation of assistance in preparing the APBD.
5. In implementing the GPP, it is necessary to use a local e-catalog in order to guarantee the prerequisites for environmentally friendly products while also empowering local producers, knowing the TKDN and carbon footprint of products in government procurement of goods/services.
6. The central government and regional governments need to establish more intensive partnerships with academics in research related to the implementation of GPP policies so that they can provide input to optimize sustainable, environmentally friendly government procurement practices for goods and services.

In closing, allow the author to make some academic suggestions regarding further studies relevant to this GPP topic.

1. Further research needs to examine other parties outside the government, PBJ actors and PBJ providers such as the community, community organizations, environmentally friendly product business actors, as well as community culture in relation to the implementation of the GPP policy in West Kalimantan Province.
2. Future research needs to develop the study object and theme of Green Public Procurement which is not limited to government procurement of environmentally friendly goods and services, because its use is broader, such as green buildings and green road construction.
3. It would be appropriate for further research to use the Sustainable Green Public Procurement (GPP) Policy Implementation Model formulated by the author, so that it can enrich the research treasures related to government procurement policies for goods and services.

ACKNOWLEDGDE

We would like to express our deepest thanks to all parties who have contributed to this research. Thank you to colleagues who have provided advice, support and inspiration during the research process. We would also like to thank all participants and respondents who took the time to participate in this research. Not to forget, we would also like to thank the agencies or institutions that have provided support and facilities in carrying out this research. All contributions and assistance provided are very meaningful for the smoothness and success of this research. Thank you for all the hard work and collaboration that has been established.

REFERENCES

- Alif, Muhammad M., 2017. "The Effect of Environmentally Friendly Labels on Brand Reputation, Mediated by Perceptions of Brand Quality and Trust in Paper Product Brands." Trisakti University. Jakarta.
- Allen, Cameron. and Stuart Clouth. 2012. "A guide to the green economy", UNDESA.
- Appolloni, Andrea et al. 2014. "Green Procurement in the private sector: a state of the art review between 1996 and 2013" in *Journal of Cleaner Production* (2014) 1 – 12. Elsevier.
- Breers, Robert. C., 2013. "The Green Economy and The Water-Energy Food", New Zealand. MacMillan Publishers Ltd.
- Dubey, Rameshwar, et al. 2013. "Green purchasing is key to superior performance: an empirical study". India. Inderscience Enterprises Ltd.
- Ervianto, Wulfram I. 2010. "Green Procurement in Green Projects". in the FTSP-ITN Malang National Seminar. Poor.

- Europe Commission, 2016. "Buying Green! – A handbook on green public procurement". Third Edition. Belgium.
- Hardianti, Sri, 2019. "Exploratory Study on Readiness to Implement Corporate Farming in Rice Farming Businesses in Bulukumba Regency." Hasanuddin University. Makassar.
- Khairarizki, Nadia and Wasiska Iyati. "Implementation of Green Construction in the Grand Kamala Lagoon Tower Emerald Bekasi Apartment Project". Architecture Department Student Journal Volume 5 No. 3. <http://arsitektur.studentjournal.ub.ac.id>. 2017.
- Manufacturing Companies in Kericho County." IJARKE Your Business Management. Kenya.
- Richard N., Kipkoech., Christopher Ngacho and Stella Omari. 2019. "Factors Influencing Implementation of Green Procurement
- Sanchez, Adriana X., et al. 2014. "Evaluation Framework For Green Procurement In Road Construction". in *Journal: Smart and Sustainable Built Environment*, Vol. 3 Iss 2 pp. 152 – 169. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1108/SASBE-05-2013-0028>.
- Spangenberg, Joachim H., Lorek, Sylvia. 2019. "Sufficiency and consumer behavior: from theory to policy", in: *Energy Policy* 129: 1070 – 1079. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.enpol.2019.03.013>.
- Stocco, Luciana B. et al, 2015. "Sustainable Procurement: The Power of Public and Private Consumption for an Inclusive Green Economy". Sao Paulo, Brazil. Programa Gestao Publica e Cidadania.
- Sugiyono, 2018. "Qualitative Research Methods". Alfabet. Bandung.
- Sukarme, Dwi. 2011. "The Influence of Evaluation Methods for Government Procurement of Goods/Services on Work Results Using the Analytical Hierarchy Process Approach (Case Study in Temanggung Regency Government)". Diponegoro University. Semarang.
- Yunita A. Messah. et al. 2016. "Study of the Implementation of Green Procurement in Road Infrastructure Projects in East Nusa Tenggara Province". *Journal of Civil Engineering*, Vol. V No. September 2, 2016.